2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
Since 2003, the Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women has recognized American corporations that create and use best practices in hiring, retaining and promoting women of color to ensure that a variety of perspectives are represented at every level of management and decision-making.
Research Methodology

Each organization completed a detailed application covering both internal and external programs and activities that benefit women of color. The 2017 application included sections on the following:

- **Representation of Multicultural Women**
- **Hiring, Attrition and Promotions**
- **Recruitment, Retention and Advancement Programs**
- **Company Culture**

To qualify for this application, companies must employ at least 500 U.S. employees.

Completed applications for the 2017 Best Companies for Multicultural Women were collected online from August 22, 2016, to November 18, 2016.

Winning companies are selected from the pool of applicant companies and ranked based on the data they provided in their applications.

Winners are announced in the June/July 2017 issue of Working Mother magazine and on workingmother.com/wmri starting May 16, 2017.

Statistics reported are aggregated based on the data from the 25 winning companies.
Summary of 2017 Findings

• The percentages of managers (14%), senior managers (8%) and corporate executives (4%) who are women of color at the 2017 Best Companies for Multicultural Women have all stayed static for four straight years.

• For the second year in a row, multicultural women make up 17% of the top fifth of earners at the Best Companies, which is significantly higher than their representation among corporate executives.

• Multicultural women represent 22% of the total workforce at the Best Companies, but they make up a larger proportion of those leaving companies (26%) and a smaller proportion of those receiving promotions to the manager level and above (14%).

• Multicultural women participate in network/affinity groups and career counseling at the Best Companies at higher rates than white men and multicultural men; however, they are less likely to participate in mentoring than any other group.

• At 28% of the Best Companies, formal compensation policies are in place to reward managers who help multicultural women advance.
Congratulations to the 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women!

Accenture ★
ADP
American Express
Bon Secours Health System
CA Technologies
Cisco
Colgate-Palmolive
Deloitte ★
First Horizon
General Mills
General Motors
Horizon Blue Cross Blue Shield of New Jersey
IBM ★
Intel
JPMorgan Chase & Co
KPMG ★
Morgan Stanley
New York Life
OppenheimerFunds
Procter & Gamble ★
Prudential Financial
PwC
Sodexo
Verizon
Wal-Mart Stores

★ Top 5 Company
Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Welcome to the Hall of Fame

Two companies have been on the Best Companies for Multicultural Women list every single one of its 15 years. For their long-term efforts to hire, retain and promote women of color we congratulate our first class of Hall of Famers:

- American Express
- IBM
By the Numbers

The 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women employ more than 2.5 million workers in 11 industries with more than 25,000 worksites across 50 states.

Automotive
Consumer Products (including Cosmetics, Food and Beverages)
Financial Services
Hospitality
Hospitals and Health Care Insurance
Manufacturing
Professional Services, Management Consulting and Accounting
Retail and Apparel
Science, Technology, Engineering, Aerospace and Medical Devices
Telecommunications
Multicultural women make up 22% of the total workforce at the Best Companies, while multicultural men represent 19% — both increased by one percentage point over last year.
As multicultural women move up the corporate ladder, their representation shrinks significantly, even compared with that of multicultural men — who represent triple the percentage of multicultural women, on average, at the corporate executive level.

White men are the only employee group to gain representation as they advance in their careers.

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Representation of multicultural women at the manager (14%), senior manager (8%) and corporate executive (4%) levels continues to hold steady at the Best Companies.

Source: 2009–2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Representation of multicultural men at the manager, senior manager and corporate executive levels continues to increase. At each job level, the representation of multicultural men increased at least a single percentage point over the previous year.
Representation of multicultural women on boards of directors held steady at 6%.

**REPRESENTATION ON BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>WHITE MEN</th>
<th>MULTICULTURAL MEN</th>
<th>WHITE WOMEN</th>
<th>MULTICULTURAL WOMEN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2009-2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Top-Tier Representation

None of the 2017 Best Companies has a multicultural woman as CEO, and six Best Companies are led by white women. Multicultural women represent 5% of executives who report directly to the CEO as well as 4% of those with profit-and-loss responsibilities.

### Representation at the CEO Level and Among Direct Reports and Executives with P&L Responsibilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>White Men</th>
<th>Multicultural Men</th>
<th>White Women</th>
<th>Multicultural Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CEOs</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executives with P&amp;L Responsibilities</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct Reports to CEO</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
At the Best Companies, CEOs demonstrate a commitment to diversity and inclusion in a number of public ways.

### IN WHICH OF THE FOLLOWING WAYS HAS YOUR CEO DEMONSTRATED A COMMITMENT TO DIVERSITY & INCLUSION?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commitment</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provides annual update on diversity to board of directors</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requires diversity executive to report back to him/her on diversity metrics</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meets regularly with diversity executive to review diversity goals and performance</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makes CEO diversity statement available on corporate website and in other corporate materials</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embeds diversity and inclusion into the business growth strategy</td>
<td>92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oversees and/or reviews metrics on supplier diversity</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Includes an update on diversity during annual updates with employees</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oversees or approves management compensation plans that are tied to diversity</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chairs or oversees Diversity Council</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is a board member of a diversity organization</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Multicultural women continue to represent 17% of the top fifth of earners—a surprisingly high number considering that they make up only 4% of corporate executives.

Source: 2015-2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Multicultural women represent 22% of the total workforce, but they make up a larger proportion of those leaving the company (26%) and a smaller proportion of those receiving promotions to the manager level and above (14%).

### Percentage of Hires, Departures and Promotions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>White Men</th>
<th>Multicultural Men</th>
<th>White Women</th>
<th>Multicultural Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hiring</strong></td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Employees Leaving the Company</strong></td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Promotions to Manager and Above</strong></td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Workforce</strong></td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Multicultural women received 16% of promotions to manager and 11% of promotions to senior manager; each rate increased by one percentage point from a year ago.

Multicultural women received 7% of promotions to corporate executive this year and last year.

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Multicultural women represent 16% of employees hired into manager positions and 10% hired as senior managers; each increased one percentage point over last year.

Multicultural women represent 4% of those hired as corporate executives, matching last year and equaling the average representation of multicultural women in that position overall.

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Departures

Among employees leaving the 2017 Best Companies, the percentage at each job level who are multicultural women fairly closely matches their representation among the workforce:

- 15% of those leaving manager positions were multicultural women, who made up 14% of those occupying manager positions.
- 8% of those leaving senior manager positions were multicultural women, matching their representation at that job level.
- 4% of those leaving corporate executive positions were multicultural women, matching their representation at that job level.

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Recruitment & Retention

Best Companies support myriad initiatives specifically designed to recruit and retain multicultural women.

PERCENTAGE OF BEST COMPANIES OFFERING EACH PROGRAM SPECIFICALLY FOR MULTICULTURAL WOMEN

- Special retention programs: 92%
- Specific recruitment initiatives (not including outside recruiters): 92%
- Forums and events: 88%
- Professional associations: 84%
- Professional development programs or classes: 84%
- Outside recruiter or staffing company targeting multicultural female candidates: 84%
- Active task force or committee: 80%

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Advancement Programs

All Best Companies offer network/affinity groups and mentoring to multicultural women, and 84% also offer mentoring specifically for younger multicultural women or those early in their career.

**ADVANCEMENT PROGRAMS OFFERED AND USAGE RATES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Percentage of Best Companies Offering Each Program</th>
<th>Percentage of Multicultural Women Who Participated in Each Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Network/Affinity Groups</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentoring</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Succession Planning</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Counseling</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sponsorship Program</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Multicultural women participate in network/affinity groups and career counseling at higher rates than white men and multicultural men; however, they are less likely to participate in mentoring than any other group.

The percentage of multicultural women who participated in mentoring decreased by almost half over last year, to 16% from 30%.
Manager Training on Diversity Issues

All 25 of the Best Companies educate managers on micro-inequities, and 24 of them educate managers on gender and race/ethnic diversity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diversity Issue</th>
<th>Number of Companies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Micro-inequities</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Diversity</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racial/Ethnic Diversity</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Orientation</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generational Diversity</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Manager Accountability

At 28% of the Best Companies, formal compensation policies are in place to reward managers who help multicultural women advance.

84% of the Best Companies set performance appraisal objectives for managers that include how they manage diversity issues.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance Appraisal Objectives</th>
<th>Number of Best Companies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee satisfaction in regard to diversity issues as measured in employee surveys</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment diversity</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback based on a 360-degree type process (a.k.a. multi-rater or multi-source feedback, etc.) in regards to diversity issues</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of multicultural female employees advancing for whom they have managerial or supervisory responsibility</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplier diversity</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Manager Training

Almost all the Best Companies offer multiple types of training to managers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training Type</th>
<th>Number of Companies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How to take actionable steps based on manager feedback</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to receive employee feedback</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to give peer-to-peer feedback</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to take actionable steps based on peer-to-peer feedback</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
All the 2017 Best Companies maintain a diverse intern pipeline, and 96% of them expect their recruiters to supply a multicultural slate of candidates for open positions.

**PERCENTAGE OF BEST COMPANIES THAT IMPLEMENT EACH HIRING PRACTICE**

- **Company maintains a diverse intern pipeline**: 100%
- **Recruiters expected to supply a multicultural slate of candidates for open positions**: 96%
- **Recruiters expected to be educated on diversity and inclusion**: 96%
- **Recruiters expected to explain why a slate does not include multicultural candidates**: 80%
- **Hiring managers must receive training in diversity and inclusion**: 80%
- **Hiring managers expected to explain their choice of job candidates if multicultural candidate is not chosen**: 48%
- **Company requires a panel of multicultural interviewers for new candidates**: 24%

Source: 2017 Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
Communication

The Best Companies share information about multicultural women’s issues with both employees and the public.

**INTERNAL COMMUNICATIONS USED TO ADDRESS ISSUES OF SPECIAL CONCERN TO MULTICULTURAL WOMEN**

- Electronic messages through e-mail, newsletters or postings: 92%
- Internal video broadcasts of executive speeches: 84%
- New employee orientation: 84%

**EXTERNAL COMMUNICATIONS USED TO ADDRESS ISSUES OF SPECIAL CONCERN TO MULTICULTURAL WOMEN**

- Executive speeches that express company values, philosophy and commitment: 92%
- Twitter feed: 84%
- Annual report: 76%
How do you rate in key areas like diversity and inclusion, women’s advancement and work life programs? The Working Mother Research Institute has the answer. With one of the most comprehensive databases available to corporate America, WMRI has the data you need to make the right decisions for both your employees and your bottom line.

To find out how your company rates, register today for one of our initiatives:

• Working Mother 100 Best Companies
• Working Mother Best Companies for Multicultural Women
  • Working Mother Best Law Firms for Women
  • NAFE Top Companies for Executive Women
  • Diversity Best Practices Inclusion Index

Participation is free and confidential.

Interested in learning more? Visit workingmother.com/surveys today!
Benchmarking
Our benchmarking reports offer the most detailed data available, showing how your company rates, question-by-question, against all Best Companies. Custom comparisons are also available.

Scorecards
Each participating company receives a free top-line summary of how it compares with all applicants across essential clusters of the initiative’s extensive application.

Custom Assessments
Let our researchers do the assessment for you. Our experienced team will turn your data into a turnkey presentation showing where your company leads and lags as compared with the Best Companies.

Interested in learning more? Contact Kristen Willoughby at kristen.willoughby@workingmother.com for more information today!
From flexibility and child care to the recruitment, retention and advancement of women, the Working Mother Research Institute is dedicated to tracking and promoting the best practices of today while creating strategies for tomorrow. WMRI’s goal is to give both working mothers and their employers the information they need to make workplaces truly family friendly.

Learn more at workingmother.com/surveys
Contact Information

Suzanne Richards, Director of Research
suzanne.richards@contractor.workingmother.com

Krista Carothers, Executive Research Editor
krista.carothers@workingmother.com

Kristen Willoughby, Director, Editorial & Research Initiatives
kristen.willoughby@workingmother.com

Michele Siegel, Director of Research Initiatives
michele.siegel@bonniercorp.com

Aviva Rosner, Custom Insights Analyst
aviva.rosner@bonniercorp.com

Learn more at workingmother.com/surveys